RFP Consolidated Scoring

Solutions Selection Option Summary
Final Findings Summary

Options Assessed and Ranking	Customer	HR	Finance	Supply Chain	WAM-Energy Delivery	WAM-Energy Supply	Technology
1. SAP Only	Green	Green	Green	Green	Green	Green	Green
2. Oracle & Maximo	Red	Yellow	Green	Yellow	Green	Green	Yellow
3. SAP & Maximo	Yellow	Green	Yellow	Yellow	Yellow	Green	Yellow

- Green — Full Capability
- Yellow — Partial or Neutral Capability
- Red — Low Capability

Note: Although the *Scoring Rollup* had SAP/Maximo ahead of Oracle/Maximo the team didn't feel there was enough improvement leveraging an SAP/Maximo WAM solution over an SAP WAM solution. This coupled with the other business area *ESS Final Readout* feedback adjusted the final ranking as displayed on this worksheet.

SAP

Business Capability Area	RFP Requirements Score (10%)	RFP Response to Questions Score (25%)	Product Demonstration Score (65%)	Business Area Score
Customer	13.84	0	18.77	13.58
Finance	15.34	10.28	15.62	14.26
Human Resources	16.34	14.67	11.32	12.66
Supply Chain	16.55	12.59	14.44	14.19
WAM - Energy Delivery	15.71	17.93	19.06	18.44
WAM - Energy Supply	15.71	16.01	16.86	16.53
			Total =	89.66

Oracle & Maximo

Business Capability Area	RFP Requirements Score (10%)	RFP Response to Questions Score (25%)	Product Demonstration Score (65%)	Business Area Score
Customer	14.12	0	15.47	11.47
Finance	16.37	15.94	16.25	16.18
Human Resources	15.75	10	6.87	8.54
Supply Chain	16.3	14.64	11.72	12.91
WAM - Energy Delivery	16.46	14.93	11.86	13.09
WAM - Energy Supply	16.46	16.49	14.92	15.47
			Total =	77.65

SAP & Maximo

Business Capability Area	RFP Requirements Score (10%)	RFP Response to Questions Score (25%)	Product Demonstration Score (65%)	Business Area Score
Customer	13.84	0	18.77	13.58
Finance	15.34	10.28	15.62	14.26
Human Resources	16.34	14.67	11.32	12.66
Supply Chain	16.55	12.59	14.44	14.19
WAM - Energy Delivery	16.46	14.93	11.86	13.09
WAM - Energy Supply	16.46	16.49	14.92	15.47
			Total =	83.24

ESS Business Area Recommendations - Working Session Readouts

Business Area	Recommendation1	Recommendation2	Recommendation3	Summary Comments
10/4/2013				
Business Systems	SAP	Oracle/Maximo	SAP/Maximo	While complex, all alternatives are supportable and viable. SAP was given a higher rating due to integrated solution benefits. SAP's integrated solution avoids complex integrations with Maximo. Long-term supportability benefits of common underlying data model and built-in integrations are potentially significant.
Customer	SAP	SAP/Maximo	Oracle/Maximo	SAP provides immediate cost savings because of ease in billing configuration and handling complex rates. The Oracle would need IT help to accomplish. SAP is better at integrating user-friendly screens; CRS isn't planned for replacement until 2020 so meter assets will be complex in any ERP solution and will require complex integration. Oracle/Maximo solution currently not felt to be viable for Customer due to some double entry and integrations. Data cleanup will be long and difficult for both solutions;
Distribution	SAP	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP/Maximo	SAP strong prep led to showing integrated solution; strong drilldown; strong scheduling tool. Oracle/Maximo solution would require an SAP Mobile solution to address needed functionality.
Energy Supply, Fossil	SAP	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP/Maximo	Aligned with Nuclear's assessment; Lockout/Tagout and logging robustness questions for reporting requirements, possible bolt-on; Corrective Action Plan questions-possible bolt-on; currently feels more secure about this with Maximo; mobility is key and SAP is ahead; long-term scheduling-IBM dropping Primavera support, so would need to develop an in-house product; Apparent SAP mobile nimbleness is positive; concerns about SAP User Interface.
Finance	SAP	Oracle/Maximo	SAP/Maximo	Oracle improved demo in Round 2; Both ERPs can handle Finance; Oracle ahead SAP for FERC, GAAP ledgers as no direct mapping required; Oracle suffered on allocations; traceability dependent on integrations; Oracle scored higher, but SAP philosophically better fit; SAP not understanding all questions; relying on System Integrator, staff for recommendation; SAP weaker on FERC-not able to be derived, has to be mapped; no clear true derivation; allocation transactions have no attributes. Finance will soldier on under all circumstances. SAP's tighter integration is more valuable especially with reporting and drill down.
Gas, Engineering, & Ops	SAP	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP/Maximo	Notes SAP integrated system drives data integrity / QA / QC, project management and resource management systems enable increased resource utilization / crew productivity, mobile application is industry leading.
HR	SAP	SAP/Maximo	Oracle/Maximo	SAP & Oracle both have good self service, mass updates. SAP better on mobile, real-time integration, replacing PAFs via Smart Forms, better integration with SuccessFactors. Stopper: Oracle E-Business Suite cannot pay an employee from two pay cycles during same time period, which happens regularly (BW-SM switches). Oracle has no canned integration between Payroll and Accounts Payable.

ESS Business Area Recommendations - Working Session Readouts				
10/4/2013				
Business Area	Recommendation1	Recommendation2	Recommendation3	Summary Comments
Nuclear	SAP	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP/Maximo	The Nuclear industry will be changing for sure. Maximo Users Group strong; SAP gaining market share in US, wider worldwide
Supply Chain	SAP	SAP/Maximo	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP provides functionality to perform tactical work (purchasing, materials, accounts payable) more efficiently enabling shift to more strategic work (category management, sourcing and contracting). Visibility will improve to BU plans improving demand planning, supplier collaboration tool enables supplier lifecycle management (from onboarding, through sourcing to SRM), and integration will improve services and material management (fleet capabilities still under review). Ariba is a particularly strong sourcing platform. So SC functionality will improve, but real benefit is end to end integration from when a project is conceived to when it is closed out.
Transmission	SAP	Oracle/Maximo (SAP Mobile)	SAP/Maximo	SAP benefits: short-term scheduling/dispatch, mobile, both of which are the core benefits in the PTT Business Case; long-term scheduling and project portfolio weak; Integrated system with SAP is a big plus, data in one place; Maximo: very weak in mobile, would need to add-on a mobile solution in order to get benefits with field personnel; Recommend Oracle/Maximo as a possible second solution because Xcel Energy has already chosen Oracle for a Project/Portfolio Management solution and Transmission is slated to move to that solution. Xcel Energy also has other Oracle software that would be easier to integrate with and Oracle/Maximo solution. Oracle has a more open architecture and more willing to work with Maximo; would need to add a mobile solution to an Oracle/Maximo solution.
. . . .	SAP: Unanimous	Oracle/Maximo 7-3 Split	SAP/Maximo 3-7 Split	. . . .